

AUDIT COMMITTEE MEETING NO. 65 WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 15, 2025 ALBANY, NEW YORK



## **AUDIT COMMITTEE AGENDA**

Meeting No. 65 January 15, 2025 Albany, New York

- 1. Approval of Minutes of Audit Committee Meeting No. 64
- 2. 2025 Fiscal Audit Plan
- 3. Other Business
- 4. Adjournment

TO:	The Audit Committee	DATE: January 15, 2025
FROM:	Julie Greco Board Secretary	
SUBJECT:	Approval of Minutes for Audit Committee M	Jeeting No. 64

Copies of the Minutes of Audit Committee Meeting No. 64 were made available to the Committee Members as part of the agenda.

# RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that the Minutes of Audit Committee Meeting No. 64, held on November 19, 2024, be approved by the Committee.



## MINUTES AUDIT COMMITTEE MEETING NO. 64 November 19, 2024

Meeting minutes of the New York State Thruway Authority Audit Committee was held in the boardroom at 200 Southern Boulevard, Albany, New York.

## The following Committee Members were present, constituting a quorum:

Jose Holguin-Veras, Ph.D., Chair Heather Briccetti-Mulligan, Committee Member Joanne M. Mahoney, (ex-officio)

## In addition, the following Board Members were present:

Robert Megna, Vice-Chair Norman Jones, Board Member Paul Tokasz, Board Member

## **Staff Present:**

Frank Hoare, Executive Director Nicole Leblond, Chief of Staff Tom McIntyre, Deputy Executive Director of Operations & Special Projects Dave Malone, Chief Financial Officer Sandra Rivera, General Counsel Brent Howard, Chief Engineer Josh Klemm, Chief Information Officer Selica Grant, Chief Administrative Officer Kevin Wisely, Chief Maintenance & Operations Officer Andrew Trombley, Chief Procurement Officer Diana Nebiolo, Chief Revenue Management Officer Jennifer Givner, Chief Media & Government Relations Officer Erika Beardsley, Chief Strategic Initiatives Officer Mary Boehm, Chief Audit & Investigations Officer Julie Greco, Board Secretary Michelle McHale, Assistant Board Secretary Debra Jung, Director, Fiscal Audit & Budget

Sean Lasher, Information Technology Specialist William Hewitt, Information Technology Specialist Kira Gruber, Excelsior Service Fellow

## **Also Present:**

Jonathan Gibbs, BST & Co. CPAs, LLC. Murray Bodin, Constituent

Dr. Veras, Committee Chair, called the meeting of the Audit Committee to order at 1:32 pm.

Ms. Greco recorded the minutes as contained herein (public notice of the meeting had been given).

## **<u>Item 1</u>** <u>Approval of Minutes of the Audit Committee Meeting No. 64 (29:24)</u>

Upon motion duly made and seconded, the Audit Committee approved the minutes of the previous meeting held on September 24, 2024. Copies of the meeting minutes were provided to the Committee Members and are maintained in Authority records.

## **<u>Item 2</u> Review and Approval of BST's Audit Plan for the fiscal year ending December 31, 2024 (29:46)**

Dave Malone, Chief Financial Officer, introduced Jonathan Gibbs from BST who provided a summary of BST's Audit Plan for the fiscal year ending December 31, 2024.

Details of the presentation are included in the video recording of the meeting and maintained by the Authority.

Upon motion duly made and seconded, the Audit Committee approved BST's audit plan for the year ending December 2024.

## Adjournment (36:31)

There being no other business to come before the Audit Committee, upon motion duly made and seconded, the meeting was adjourned at 1:39 p.m.

Note: Webcasts, which include dialogue of the Authority's Audit Committee Meeting, are available on the Thruway Authority website 48 hours after such meetings occur and remain on the website for a period of four months. The meeting minutes have been time-stamped to indicate when each item is discussed on the webcast.

TO:	The Audit Committee	DATE:	January 15, 2025
FROM:	David Malone Chief Financial Officer		
SUBJECT:	Bureau of Fiscal Audit's 2025 Audit Plan		

The Chief Financial Officer formally submits the Bureau of Fiscal Audit's 2025 Audit Plan.

Enclosed please find the following:

- Bureau of Fiscal Audit's 2025 Audit Plan.
- Preliminary Accomplishments Report for 2024
- Report of Accomplishments for 2021-2023
- Summary tables detailing number of audits performed and resource allocation for 2021, 2022 and 2023

New York State Thruway Authority Office of Fiscal Audit and Budget 2025 Audit Plan

## Bureau of Fiscal Audit 2025 Audit Plan

Enclosed please find the Bureau of Fiscal Audit's 2025 Audit Plan. The plan is updated annually to adjust for new initiatives, revise processes, adapt to changes to better reflect the priorities of the organization, and to allocate our resources more efficiently.

# **Risk Based** – Analysis of operating controls, likelihood of material failure and impact to operations and finances:

The plan was developed using a risk-based approach. The first step in developing the plan is to group key functions together into Primary Audit Areas, which are used as a guide on how to allocate audit staff. The next step analyzes the likelihood of failures occurring in a key function, considering the controls, or lack of controls in place to prevent or minimize the failure from occurring. These controls are established and monitored by the operating department in most situations. The next step is to evaluate the impact that a potential failure would have on Authority operations and finances. The definition of failure is principal to the analysis, as it must be measurable and material in nature. Good controls can also minimize the magnitude of the impact of a failure.

## **Overall Risk Assessment:**

The assessment is based on the residual possibility that detection controls will not identify operating control breakdowns in a timely manner, and material failures will occur.

## Audit Plan – Detection controls and reporting:

The audit function includes detection controls that consist of reviews and audits to test that operating controls are in place and that proper procedures are followed and documented. Audit reports summarizing findings are provided to leaders and managers that document weaknesses or lack of controls, review whether procedures are being followed and that records are updated timely, provide recommendations for improvements, and remind supervisors and personnel of proper procedures. The recommendations are designed to eliminate or reduce the likelihood of a control failure and provide measures to minimize the impact that theses failures will have on the organization. Auditors also follow up on their reports to verify that recommendations have been implemented or acted upon. Our outside auditors annually review our reports on a sample basis and have found them acceptable to rely on.

## Audit Areas in Annual Plan:

<u>Audit Area 1</u> – Revenues and Reimbursements, includes the below described Cashless Tolling and Workzone Safety activities as well as audits of Concession and Fiber Revenue and reimbursements for Federal Disaster Assistance and other Claims and Grants.

<u>Audit Area 2</u> – Financial Reporting and Regulatory Compliance, includes production of required annual financial reports for internal and external use.

<u>Audit Area 3</u> – Billings and Contract Compliance, includes processing payments and auditing of the Cashless Tolling Systems and Administrative providers, Engineering and other Personal Services Agreements.

<u>Audit Area 4</u> – Asset Control, includes physical verification of Equipment and Materials Inventories and controls over Financial assets such as Cash, Checks, P-Cards and Accounts Receivable.

<u>Audit Area 5</u> – Salary and Benefits, reviews of all items that impact employee compensation and Authority benefit expenditures.

## **Staff Allocation:**

Based on analysis of risk components, staff hours are allocated to each primary audit area required to perform detection controls assessment to reduce overall risk to an acceptable level. 2024 staff activities continued evaluating those audit areas that posed the highest risk to the Authority such as Audit Areas 1 - Revenues and 3 – Billings and Contract Compliance.

For 2025 the Audit Plan will continue to evolve and capture more staff time dedicated to continued oversight of post-transition vendor compliance and performance, reporting, and establishment of new audits and reconciling activities. Management will also use the Plan to track staff time and document activities that diverge from the plan as they arise.

## **Summary Table:**

The 2025 chart displays a summary of the rating of each component of the risk assessment, audit staff allocation and overall risk assessment of the primary audit areas. Attached are detailed overviews of the five primary audit areas with analysis and past audit results to support the rating of the components of a risk analysis (controls, likelihood that failures will occur and impact to operations or finances when failures occur) to support an overall risk assessment rating.

## Bureau of Fiscal Audit 2025 Audit Plan Risk Assessment Summary

	Ris	sk Componen	<u>ts</u>				
	Operating	Likelihood of	Impact to		Staff		Overall Risk
Primary Audit Areas	Controls	Failure	Operations		Allocation		Assessment
Area 1 - Revenues & Reimbursements							
Key Functions Include:							
Cashless Tolling	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate/High		34%		High
Concessions, Fiber and Lease Revenue				F		F	
Federal Reimbursements - Disaster Claims & Mitigation Grants							
Area 2 - Financial Reporting & Regulatory Compliance							
Key Functions Include:	Strong	Low	Moderate		3%		Low
Financial Statement Review	Strong	LOW	Woderale		576		LOW
Regulatory & Financial Reporting				r		r	
Area 3 - Billings & Contract Compliance							
Key Functions Include:							
Cashless Tolling Administration							
Engineering Consultants	Strong	Moderate	Moderate/High	~	34%	N	Moderate
Other Personal Service Contracts							
State Agency Billings				,		,	
Concessionaires - Remediation, Renewal and Replacement							
Area 4 - Asset Control							
Key Functions Include:						<b>N</b>	
Equipment	Moderate	Moderate	Low		18%		Low
Inventory				r		, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	
Checks, Credit Cards & Accounts Receivable							
Area 5 - Salary & Benefits - Employees & Retirees							
Key Functions Include:						N	
Employee Compensation	Moderate	Low/Moderate	Low		11%		Low
Health Insurance and Other Benefits						r	
Time & Attendance							

#### 2025 Audit Plan Audit Categories and Counts New York State Thruway Authority

Audit Area	Category Description	Audit Category Number	2024 Number of Audits
Area 1 - Reven	ues & Reimbursements		
	ss Tolling:		
	Customer Account Financial Adjustments (Settlement of Customer Debt)	1-1A	4
	Transfer of Responsibility (TOR) Process Flow	1-1B	2
	Toll Transaction Process Flow	1-1C	1
	Quarterly Rejected Transactions Review	1-1D	4
	Negative Account Balance Review	1-1E	4
	Audit of Discount Plans	1-1F	4
	Toll Rate Changes	1-1G	1
	Collections Customer Payments Vendor To Vendor Reconciliation	1-1H	4
	Collection Payment Posting	1-11	2
	Collection/Vendor Direct Payment Reporting	1-1J	2
	Tag Stock Inventory	1-1K	1
	Non-Revenue Tag	1-1L	2
	Reserved for Special Cashless Tolling Projects	1-1M	2
			33
Cashle	ss Tolling Reimbursements:		
	NYS Bridge Authority Quarterly Chargeback Billings	1-2A	4
	Peace Bridge Quarterly Chargeback Billings	1-2B	4
	Thousand Island Bridge Authority Quarterly Chargeback Billings	1-2C	4
	Annual State Police E-ZPass tag billing	1-2D	1
	Niagara Frontier Bridge Commission Tag Packages	1-2E	1
			14
Other:			
	Service Station Rentals	1-3A	1
	Fiber Revenue	1-3B	1
	Restaurant Rentals	1-3C	1
	Restaurant - Review of New Restaurant Construction	1-3D	1
	Workzone Safety - Operations	1-3E	4
			8
Federa	I Disaster Assistance, Claims & Grants		
	FEMA/FHWA Thruway	1-4A	5
	FEMA/FHWA Canal (closeouts of previous awards)	1-4B	0
	Grants - Miscellaneous	1-4C	As needed
			5
Total -	Area 1		60

Audit Area	Category Description	Audit Category Number	2024 Numb of Audits
Area 2 - Financ	ial Reporting & Regulatory Compliance		
Financi	al Statement Review:		
	Annual Audit Plan For Thruway Board	2-1A	1
	E-ZPass and Tolls By Mail Expenses & Budget Review	2-1B	2
	Review of Audited Financial Statements, Notes & External Auditor's Reports	2-1C	1
	Pre-Audit of Monthly Financial Statements	2-1D	0
	Assist Accounting Year End Estimated Liability for Environmental Claims	2-1E	1
	Assist Accounting Year End Contract Liability set-ups - Operating	2-1F	1
	Assist Accounting Year End Vacation Liability	2-1G	1
	Assist Accounting Year End Contract Liability set-ups - Capital	2-1H	Ó
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		7
Regula	tory Reporting:		
	RESERVED for Other Regulatory Reporting	2-2A	As needed
	Annual Public Authority Data Request (PARIS)/Board	2-2B	1
	State Comptroller's Audit Report Review	2-2C	As needed
			1
Confirm	nations & Reconciliations		
	Investments & Collateral	2-3B	1
	Accounts Receivable	2-3C	1
			2
			<b></b>
Total - Area 3 - Billing	Area 2 s & Contract Compliance	_	10
	s & Contract Compliance	-	
Area 3 - Billing	s & Contract Compliance tants:	3-1A	
Area 3 - Billing	s & Contract Compliance tants: Audit of Monthly Billings - Cashless Tolling and Workzone Safety	3-1A 3-1B	10
Area 3 - Billing	s & Contract Compliance tants: Audit of Monthly Billings - Cashless Tolling and Workzone Safety Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Office Audits		<b>10</b> 56
Area 3 - Billing	s & Contract Compliance tants: Audit of Monthly Billings - Cashless Tolling and Workzone Safety Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Office Audits Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Field Audits	3-1B	<b>10</b> 56 125
Area 3 - Billing	s & Contract Compliance tants: Audit of Monthly Billings - Cashless Tolling and Workzone Safety Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Office Audits	3-1B 3-1C	<b>10</b> 56 125 0 10
Area 3 - Billing	s & Contract Compliance tants: Audit of Monthly Billings - Cashless Tolling and Workzone Safety Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Office Audits Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Field Audits Pre-Award Audits Engineering - D Contracts Contractor's Claims	3-1B 3-1C 3-1D	<b>10</b> 56 125 0 10
Area 3 - Billing	s & Contract Compliance tants: Audit of Monthly Billings - Cashless Tolling and Workzone Safety Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Office Audits Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Field Audits Pre-Award Audits Engineering - D Contracts Contractor's Claims Processing Contract Payments (est. 600) Pre-Payment Audit	3-1B 3-1C 3-1D 3-1E	<b>10</b> 56 125 0 10 As needed
Area 3 - Billing	s & Contract Compliance tants: Audit of Monthly Billings - Cashless Tolling and Workzone Safety Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Office Audits Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Field Audits Pre-Award Audits Engineering - D Contracts Contractor's Claims Processing Contract Payments (est. 600) Pre-Payment Audit Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts)	3-1B 3-1C 3-1D 3-1E 3-1F	<b>10</b> 56 125 0 10 As needed 0
Area 3 - Billing	s & Contract Compliance tants: Audit of Monthly Billings - Cashless Tolling and Workzone Safety Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Office Audits Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Field Audits Pre-Award Audits Engineering - D Contracts Contractor's Claims Processing Contract Payments (est. 600) Pre-Payment Audit Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Benefits	3-1B 3-1C 3-1D 3-1E 3-1F 3-1G	<b>10</b> 56 125 0 10 As needed 0 4
Area 3 - Billing	s & Contract Compliance tants: Audit of Monthly Billings - Cashless Tolling and Workzone Safety Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Office Audits Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Field Audits Pre-Award Audits Engineering - D Contracts Contractor's Claims Processing Contract Payments (est. 600) Pre-Payment Audit Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Benefits Legal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts	3-1B 3-1C 3-1D 3-1E 3-1F 3-1G 3-1H 3-1H 3-11	10 56 125 0 10 As needed 0 4 20 15
Area 3 - Billing	s & Contract Compliance tants: Audit of Monthly Billings - Cashless Tolling and Workzone Safety Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Office Audits Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Field Audits Pre-Award Audits Engineering - D Contracts Contractor's Claims Processing Contract Payments (est. 600) Pre-Payment Audit Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Benefits Legal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts Real Estate Appraisal billings - C Contracts	3-1B 3-1C 3-1D 3-1E 3-1F 3-1G 3-1H	10 56 125 0 10 As needed 0 4 20
Area 3 - Billing	s & Contract Compliance tants: Audit of Monthly Billings - Cashless Tolling and Workzone Safety Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Office Audits Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Field Audits Pre-Award Audits Engineering - D Contracts Contractor's Claims Processing Contract Payments (est. 600) Pre-Payment Audit Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Benefits Legal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts Real Estate Appraisal billings - C Contracts Utilities & Municipal Agreements	3-1B 3-1C 3-1D 3-1E 3-1F 3-1G 3-1H 3-1I 3-1J	10 56 125 0 10 As needed 0 4 20 15 4
Area 3 - Billing	s & Contract Compliance tants: Audit of Monthly Billings - Cashless Tolling and Workzone Safety Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Office Audits Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Field Audits Pre-Award Audits Engineering - D Contracts Contractor's Claims Processing Contract Payments (est. 600) Pre-Payment Audit Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Benefits Legal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts Real Estate Appraisal billings - C Contracts	3-1B 3-1C 3-1D 3-1E 3-1F 3-1G 3-1H 3-1I 3-1J 3-1K	10 56 125 0 10 As needed 0 4 20 15 4 5
Area 3 - Billing	s & Contract Compliance tants: Audit of Monthly Billings - Cashless Tolling and Workzone Safety Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Office Audits Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Field Audits Pre-Award Audits Engineering - D Contracts Contractor's Claims Processing Contract Payments (est. 600) Pre-Payment Audit Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Benefits Legal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts Real Estate Appraisal billings - C Contracts Utilities & Municipal Agreements Railroads / Force Agreements	3-1B 3-1C 3-1D 3-1E 3-1F 3-1G 3-1H 3-11 3-1J 3-1K 3-1L	10 56 125 0 10 As needed 0 4 20 15 4 5 2
Area 3 - Billing Consul	s & Contract Compliance tants: Audit of Monthly Billings - Cashless Tolling and Workzone Safety Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Office Audits Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Field Audits Pre-Award Audits Engineering - D Contracts Contractor's Claims Processing Contract Payments (est. 600) Pre-Payment Audit Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Benefits Legal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts Real Estate Appraisal billings - C Contracts Utilities & Municipal Agreements Railroads / Force Agreements	3-1B 3-1C 3-1D 3-1E 3-1F 3-1G 3-1H 3-11 3-1J 3-1K 3-1L	10 56 125 0 10 As needed 0 4 20 15 4 5 2 2 2
Area 3 - Billing Consul	s & Contract Compliance tants: Audit of Monthly Billings - Cashless Tolling and Workzone Safety Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Office Audits Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Field Audits Pre-Award Audits Engineering - D Contracts Contractor's Claims Processing Contract Payments (est. 600) Pre-Payment Audit Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Benefits Legal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts Real Estate Appraisal billings - C Contracts Utilities & Municipal Agreements Railroads / Force Agreements On-Demand Contract Audit Immental Agencies: Department of Law	3-1B 3-1C 3-1D 3-1E 3-1F 3-1G 3-1H 3-11 3-1J 3-1K 3-1L	10 56 125 0 10 As needed 0 4 20 15 4 5 2 2 2 2 43 As needed
Area 3 - Billing Consul	s & Contract Compliance tants: Audit of Monthly Billings - Cashless Tolling and Workzone Safety Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Office Audits Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Field Audits Pre-Award Audits Engineering - D Contracts Contractor's Claims Processing Contract Payments (est. 600) Pre-Payment Audit Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Benefits Legal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts Real Estate Appraisal billings - C Contracts Utilities & Municipal Agreements Railroads / Force Agreements On-Demand Contract Audit umental Agencies:	3-1B 3-1C 3-1D 3-1F 3-1F 3-1G 3-1H 3-1H 3-1J 3-1K 3-1L 3-1M	10 56 125 0 10 As needed 0 4 20 15 4 5 2 2 2 2 43 As needed
Area 3 - Billing Consul	s & Contract Compliance tants: Audit of Monthly Billings - Cashless Tolling and Workzone Safety Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Office Audits Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Field Audits Pre-Award Audits Engineering - D Contracts Contractor's Claims Processing Contract Payments (est. 600) Pre-Payment Audit Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Benefits Legal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts Real Estate Appraisal billings - C Contracts Utilities & Municipal Agreements Railroads / Force Agreements On-Demand Contract Audit Immental Agencies: Department of Law	3-1B 3-1C 3-1D 3-1E 3-1F 3-1G 3-1H 3-1I 3-1J 3-1K 3-1L 3-1M 3-2A	10 56 125 0 10 As needed 0 4 20 15 4 5 2 2 2 2 43 As needed
Area 3 - Billing Consul	s & Contract Compliance tants: Audit of Monthly Billings - Cashless Tolling and Workzone Safety Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Office Audits Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Field Audits Pre-Award Audits Engineering - D Contracts Contractor's Claims Processing Contract Payments (est. 600) Pre-Payment Audit Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Benefits Legal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts Real Estate Appraisal billings - C Contracts Utilities & Municipal Agreements Railroads / Force Agreements On-Demand Contract Audit Immental Agencies: Department of Law Office of the State Comptroller Billing	3-1B 3-1C 3-1D 3-1E 3-1F 3-1G 3-1H 3-1I 3-1J 3-1K 3-1L 3-1M 3-2A 3-2B	10 56 125 0 10 As needed 0 4 20 15 4 5 2 2 2 2 2 4 3 5 4 5 2 2 2 2 4 3 8 5 8 5 6 125 0 10 4 5 6 125 0 10 5 6 10 5 6 10 5 0 10 5 0 10 5 5 0 10 5 5 0 10 5 5 0 10 5 5 0 10 5 5 0 10 5 5 0 10 5 5 0 10 5 5 0 10 5 5 0 10 5 5 0 10 5 5 0 10 5 5 0 10 5 5 0 10 5 5 0 10 5 5 10 5 5 10 5 5 10 5 5 5 5
Area 3 - Billing Consul	s & Contract Compliance tants: Audit of Monthly Billings - Cashless Tolling and Workzone Safety Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Office Audits Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Field Audits Pre-Award Audits Engineering - D Contracts Contractor's Claims Processing Contract Payments (est. 600) Pre-Payment Audit Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Benefits Legal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts Real Estate Appraisal billings - C Contracts Utilities & Municipal Agreements Railroads / Force Agreements On-Demand Contract Audit Immental Agencies: Department of Law Office of the State Comptroller Billing Department of Civil Service Administration	3-1B 3-1C 3-1D 3-1E 3-1F 3-1G 3-1H 3-1J 3-1J 3-1K 3-1L 3-1L 3-1M 3-2A 3-2B 3-2C	10 56 125 0 10 As needed 0 4 20 15 4 5 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 3 3 4 5 2 2 2 2 3 3 4 5 2 2 2 3 3 5 4 5 2 2 2 3 3 5 4 5 5 0 125 0 10 5 0 10 5 0 10 5 0 10 5 0 10 5 0 10 5 0 10 5 10 5 0 10 5 10 5 10 5 10 10 5 10 10 5 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10
Area 3 - Billing Consul	s & Contract Compliance tants: Audit of Monthly Billings - Cashless Tolling and Workzone Safety Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Office Audits Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Field Audits Pre-Award Audits Engineering - D Contracts Contractor's Claims Processing Contract Payments (est. 600) Pre-Payment Audit Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Benefits Legal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts Real Estate Appraisal billings - C Contracts Utilities & Municipal Agreements Railroads / Force Agreements On-Demand Contract Audit umental Agencies: Department of Law Office of the State Comptroller Billing Department of Civil Service Administration NYS Retirement System Billing	3-1B 3-1C 3-1D 3-1E 3-1F 3-1G 3-1H 3-11 3-1J 3-1K 3-1L 3-1L 3-1M 3-2A 3-2B 3-2C 3-2D	10 56 125 0 10 As needed 0 4 20 15 4 5 2 2 2 2 2 2 43 As needed 2 2 1
Area 3 - Billing Consul	s & Contract Compliance tants: Audit of Monthly Billings - Cashless Tolling and Workzone Safety Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Office Audits Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Field Audits Pre-Award Audits Engineering - D Contracts Contractor's Claims Processing Contract Payments (est. 600) Pre-Payment Audit Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Benefits Legal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts Real Estate Appraisal billings - C Contracts Utilities & Municipal Agreements Railroads / Force Agreements On-Demand Contract Audit umental Agencies: Department of Law Office of the State Comptroller Billing Department of Civil Service Administration NYS Retirement System Billing State Police Troop T Payroll (Quarterly)	3-1B 3-1C 3-1D 3-1E 3-1F 3-1G 3-1H 3-1I 3-1J 3-1K 3-1L 3-1L 3-1M 3-2A 3-2B 3-2C 3-2D 3-2E	10 56 125 0 10 As needed 0 4 20 15 4 5 2 2 2 2 2 2 4 3 5 2 2 2 2 2 4 3 As needed 2 2 2 1 4 4 5 2 2 2 1 4 3 5 4 5 5 6 15 5 0 10 4 20 10 4 5 10 5 10 5 10 4 5 10 5 10 10 5 10 10 4 5 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10

Audit Area	Category Description	Audit Category Number	2024 Number of Audits
Concessi	ons:		
	Concessionaire Agreements - Repair & Replacement, Cap Imp.	3-3A	2
	Concessionaire Agreements - Gas Pricing Review	3-3B	2
	Fuel Service Facilities - Remediations Ongoing	3-3C	12
	Concessionaire Agreements - Field Audit	3-3D	1
		0.02	17
Other:	Assistance to Other Units - Review of RFPs and Draft Contracts, Eval Committees	3-4A	2
Other.		3-47	2
Total - A	202 B		272
Area 4 - Asset Co			212
-1ea - A33et 0			
Equipme			
	Motorized Equipment	4-1A	4
	Office/Computer Equipment	4-1B	6
	Shop Equipment	4-1C	6
	Communications Equipment Inventory	4-1D	As needed
	Toll Equipment	4-1E	2
	Tool Complements & Controls	4-1F	18
	Scrapping or Surplus Assets	4-1G	As needed
Inventory			36
inventory	Fuel Inventory Reconciliation	4-2A	1
		4-2A 4-2B	7
	Annual Physical Inventories (4 Divisions, ITSM, Inv. Mgmt. & Sign Shop)		
	Section Stores Inventory Verification	4-2C	6
	Division Stores Inventory Verification	4-2D	As needed 14
Cash, Ch	ecks, Credit cards and Accounts Receivable:		17
	Procurement Card Audits	4-3A	6
	Account Receivable Confirmations	4-3B	1
	Account Receivable Reconciliation	4-3C	1
	Cash Funds (petty cash)	4-3D	7
	Check Signing reconciliation	4-3E	12
		4-3L	27
Total - A	rea 4		77
Area 5 - Salary &	Benefits - Employees & Retirees		
- <i>i</i>			
Employee	e Compensation (Payroll & Negotiated Benefits)	5 4 4	
	Salary Raises/Step Advances	5-1A	1
	Retroactive Salary or Contractual Payments (Call-out Incentive)	5-1B	2
	Vacation Buyback	5-1C	1
	Health Insurance Opt-out	5-1D	1
	Semi-Annual Incentive & Bonus for Non-use Sick Leave	5-1E	4
	Payoff & Comparison of Payroll to Roster (Obsolete)	5-1F	0
	Commuter Use of TWY Provided Vehicles	5-1G	1
	Employee Payroll Audit	5-1H	2
	Reserved - Special Project	5-11	1

Audit Area	Category Description	Audit Category Number	2024 Number of Audits
Health	Insurance & Other Fringe Benefits: Pre-Implementation Audit of Health Insurance Rates	5-2A	1
	Reconciliation of TWY Health Insurance Enrollees	5-2B	1
	Unemployment Billings Review	5-2C	As needed
	Survivor's Benefit	5-2D	4
			6
Time 8	Attendance: Field Audits		
	Verification of Timekeeper Records	5-3A	12
			12
Total -	Area 5		31
TOTAL	L ALL CATEGORIES		450

## Audit Area 1- Revenues and Reimbursements

#### **Overview and Risk Identification**

Authority revenue is closely monitored and reviewed by the Bureau of Fiscal Audit. The main source of revenue for the Thruway Authority are the tolls collected for the use of the Thruway system. Other sources of income include revenues from concessionaires, E-ZPass and Tolls by Mail fees, fiber optic user fees, rentals, interest earnings, special hauling permits, and other sundry revenues. Federal aid and emergency disaster relief reimbursements along with Federal and State grants are billed and tracked. Many of the controls to account for toll revenues and reimbursements are audited daily by Fiscal Audit staff.

Risks are based on the likelihood that the following situations may occur: E-ZPass and Tolls by Mail toll transactions are unidentifiable, not billed or misreported; inaccurate toll fares are charged; payments are not reported, collected and deposited properly, or fraudulent activities have occurred. Other possible risks to revenue collection are that concessionaire payments are under reported, inaccurately calculated or that Interest and Sundry revenues are misreported. Risks relating to reimbursements include failure to invoice for reimbursements of reciprocal agency tolling expenses, failure to apply for, document and properly submit all disaster related reimbursements, failure to bill and track other reimbursements including environmental claims, and missed grant and other aid opportunities. These failures could result in the loss of revenues or reimbursements that could impact Authority finances, bond rating, reputation, and draw increased regulatory scrutiny and oversight.

#### Key Functions and Audit Activities

#### **Cashless Tolling**

E-ZPass accounts for approximately 95% (\$789.5 million in 2023) of Authority toll revenue (\$825.5 million). The Thruway Authority along with the Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA) and Port Authority of New York and New Jersey (PANYNJ), have contracts with Conduent State and Local Solutions, Inc. (Conduent), TTEC Governmental Solutions LLC (TTEC), and Transcore LP (Transcore), to furnish, install, operate the Account Management, Customer Service, and Tag Distribution aspects of an Electronic Toll Collection System, E-ZPass. Toll transactions and violations are sent to Conduent, who then posts the transactions to the customer's account and reports the revenues and other fees collected to the Authority's Finance Office for Passenger, Business and Commercial Prepaid accounts. Commercial Postpaid accounts are managed and billed through the Authority's Commercial Charge Account Program. The internal controls of Conduent, TTEC, and Transcore are reviewed, audited, and subsequently reported on annually by independent auditors, and the results have been provided to the Authority in a SOC 1 report under the Standards for Attestation Engagements (SSAE) #16 report. Conduent State and Local Solutions, Inc. operates the account management, billing and payment aspects of the cashless Tolls by Mail program for video toll transactions. Electronic toll transactions and license plate video images are sent to Conduent, who then use the plate numbers to obtain the patron's current mailing address through the DMV of their state or to bill on previously established accounts. Conduent mails out Toll Bills and escalated Violation Notices and tracks their status, processes and deposits all payments, and provides transaction and revenue reports to the Authority's Fiscal Audit and Finance offices. Unpaid Bills and Notices that have not been paid within 120 days of initial transaction are placed for collection with NYSTA's collection agent.

The Bureau of Fiscal Audit has dedicated staff who audit the Cashless Tolling operations of the contract, review financial transactions on customer and violator accounts, review collections from the outside collection agency, and financial adjustments made to customer account balances. Fiscal Audit and Finance staff are in contact with Conduent and the other reciprocal agencies through meetings and constant communications about data and the process and procedures of E-ZPass and the Tolls by Mail program.

#### **Concession Lease Payments**

Concessionaire lease payments from two fuel service and one food service operator service areas across New York, totaled \$15.2M in rental revenue in 2023, up from \$11.7M in 2022. In July 2021 the Authority along with Empire State Thruway Partners launched a \$450 million service area redevelopment and redesign project for food service operations. This project is overseen by the Office of Travelers' Services. The Bureau of Fiscal Audit will provide support and guidance relative to the documentation for Capital Improvement costs, future Rehabilitation and Reinvestment Reserve and rental reports.

Controls for verifying rental revenue received from the current operators are strong, as restaurant sales and fuel deliveries are reviewed and variances investigated on a monthly and year to date basis. Fiscal Audit conducts post audits of rent payments and other contract provisions for all the operators on an annual basis, including compliance to minimum annual guaranteed rent. Fiscal Audit also works with our independent auditors to ensure that in accordance with the contract, the concessionaires maintain good internal controls of their records and operations. Procedures will be modified as needed to retain strong controls under the new agreements.

## Federal Assistance - Disaster Claims and Mitigation Grants

Federal disaster assistance claims originate from weather related events (Snow, Ice, Wind, Flooding, etc or other State Emergency). There are two different sources for disaster assistance: FEMA and FHWA. The program used depends on the specifics of the eligible damage or the State/Federal declaration. Once a State and/or Federal disaster event is identified, Division Personnel are notified and specific work orders are set up to accumulate costs, which are then submitted to Fiscal Audit. The FEMA project manager coordinates cost submissions, correspondences and meetings to identify, clarify and resolve all eligibility and program issues with FEMA, FHWA and New York State Division of Homeland Security & Emergency Services (NYSDHSES). Thruway claims are billed and tracked to final disposition and receipt of funds. Reimbursement of projects obligated by FEMA under December 2022 Snowstorm Elliot (DR-4694), 2023 July Flooding (DR-4723), and 2023 September Flooding (DR-4755) are still in process for approximately \$68k. Anticipated reimbursements of over \$1.75 million for projects not yet obligated under COVID-19 (DR-4480), Hurricane Debby (DR-4825), Hurricane Helene (EMAC/NYSIMT) and Sterling Creek Wildfire (FM-5547) are currently being reviewed by FEMA for eligibility. There are no new FEMA identified disasters that have not been addressed by the Authority.

## **Overall Risk Assessment of Revenues and Reimbursements**

The Authority has written procedures on documenting Cashless Tolling revenue that is reported to be collectible. Established controls related to pre-paid and post-paid toll and fee revenue are in place to track the set-up of receivables and reimbursements, monitor the status of amounts billed and received, and for tolls that are determined to be uncollectable. Operating controls in place and the likelihood of failure are moderate. The impact on operations is considered high because a failure could have a material impact given toll revenue is the highest percentage revenue source of the Authority's overall revenue.

Concessionaire Lease Payments and Federal Reimbursements operating controls are considered strong. The likelihood of failures is moderate, but activities are continuously monitored, so the likelihood of material failure is low.

Overall risk assessment for this entire audit area is high.

## Audit Area 2 – Financial Reporting & Regulatory Compliance

## **Overview and Risk Identification**

The NYS Thruway Authority, a legally and fiscally separate and distinct organization from the State of New York, is responsible for its own finances and budget, and produces a variety of financial statements and reports to provide both internal and external users with financial information regarding its operating results and financial condition. These statements and reports are required by various governmental agencies and legislation. Authority and State bond program managers, advisors and bond rating agencies require timely financial statements and reports before public offerings can be made. In order to ensure the reliable, accurate and timely compilation of these statements and reports, the Bureau of Fiscal Audit performs various periodic reviews and audits and assists in their production. Audit staff provide assistance in producing the Annual Report and required analysis of the Authority's financial reports prior to issuance.

Risks are based upon the likelihood of undetected errors or misstatements within these financial statements, notes to the financial statements and/or reports, and the possibility that such errors or misstatements would be of a material amount. Material is defined as having an impact on an informed financial statement reader. The impact of these errors could result in erroneous decision making in current and long-range planning and controlling of operations and achieving the organization's goals. Material impacts could include a decrease in bond ratings, which increases costs of borrowing, increased regulatory scrutiny, corrective costs and negative public/private perception.

## **Key Functions and Fiscal Audit Activities:**

### **Financial Statement Review**

The Bureau of Fiscal Audit performs reviews and/or audits of various pages of the Financial Statements and reports in accordance with detailed audit programs. The Authority's fiscal year is on a calendar year basis. The audit programs include tests of the accuracy and reasonableness of calculations made and amounts presented, when compared to actual source data, such as various expense, budget and revenue reports generated from the Authority's Thruway Financial Package (TFP) and other reporting systems. The following are reviewed:

- Estimated Future Claims and Environmental Liability, Contractual Liability and Accrued Expense Account Balances
- Annual Financial Statements and Notes
- Regulatory reporting

### **Regulatory and Financial Reporting**

Fiscal Audit provides comprehensive reviews and compilation of data contained annual Financial Statements that are provided to New York State agencies and certified by our external auditors. Annual financial statements and reports are required to be submitted, and information uploaded to the Office of the State Comptroller / Authority Budget Office's Public Authority Reporting Information System (PARIS). This information is made publicly available. As a result, potential risk associated with undetected errors and misstatements could also cause a negative impact to the Authority, the State and other businesses and organizations that rely on these reports. Fiscal Audit reviews the consistency of financial information derived from different sources within the Authority.

Fiscal Audit prepares the calculation of estimated liabilities for the annual year end reporting, per GASB, including the liability for Construction, Architectural and Engineering and Personal Service/Lease agreement contract agreements.

Fiscal Audit prepares the annual Procurement report for Construction, Architectural and Engineering and Personal Service contract and Lease agreements for submission into the PARIS statewide database and preparation of the report for the NYSTA Board of Directors.

Fiscal Audit participates in compiling data and providing responses to external audits and other inquiries, as well as provide support for reports used for bond issuance for Ratings Agencies, Federal Financial Assistance and others.

## **Overall Risk Assessment Financial Reporting & Regulatory Compliance**

Based on periodic audits and a review of the controls in place, the controls are evaluated as strong and the likelihood that material errors will go undetected in Authority financial statements and reports is low to moderate. Overall risk assessment for this area is low.

## Audit Area 3 – Billings and Contract Compliance

## **Overview and Risk Identification**

The Bureau of Fiscal Audit performs reviews and audits of billings received and contract payments made by the Authority for a variety of services provided in accordance with contracts with business entities and agreements with various State agencies. In 2023, approximately 856 billings were reviewed with a value of about \$122.1 million paid to consultants, for personal service contracts and for lease agreements. Services provided by consultants consist of engineering services (design, construction inspection, and architectural), and personal services contracts include legal, economic, financial, real estate, human resources services, accounting services, and E-ZPass and Tolls by Mail administration. Other billings include various services provided by the New York State Departments of Civil Service, DOT, the Office of the State Comptroller, Attorney General, and others. The Authority also reimburses the Division of State Police for Troop T's costs of patrolling the Thruway.

Existing food concession contracts include building and equipment renewal and replacement provisions and the fuel vendor contracts have both equipment replacement and capital improvement requirements. Fuel contracts include provisions outlining the operators' and Authority's responsibility for environmental spill remediation and clean-up. In accordance with regulatory agreements and procedures, the Authority is reimbursing fuel vendors for ongoing remediation monitoring at several service area locations where past environmental contamination occurred.

In performing audits of these agreements, expenses and supporting documentation are reviewed and tests are conducted for reasonableness, mathematical accuracy, and conformity to contractual guidelines mandated by State and Federal regulations, as well as review and approval of the work by Authority engineers and other contract managers. As a result, billings and project costs are approved, adjusted, held or disapproved in accordance with contract provisions, and if costs were attributed to a previous operator, then they are billed in accordance with that agreement.

Risks include the likelihood that billings which include improper or inaccurate costs in accordance with contract guidelines get processed, paid and recorded in the Authority's financial records. Inaccurate and incorrect cost reporting can also impact current and future management decision making, regarding planning and cash flow needs. Contract non-compliance by concessionaires regarding capital improvements and replacement and renewal requirements can impact customer safety and satisfaction at our Travel Plazas. Any instance of a fuel spill or non-compliance with environmental regulations can lead to citations, claims and facility shut down with little or no service available to Authority patrons. Additional risk could arise by allowing for the payment of sub-standard work, or work performed by unqualified firms or unlicensed individuals, which could affect public safety and potential liabilities.

## Key Functions and Fiscal Audit Activities

#### **Processing Contract Payments in Contract Management System**

Invoices for Engineering Consultant agreements as well as a wide variety of other Personal Service Contracts and Lease Payments are routed through Fiscal Audit for payment processing. Fiscal Audit ensures that the invoices have been approved by the Authority Project or Contract manager or appropriate Department head, is compliant with contract provisions captured in the Authority's Contract Management System (Unifier), that funding is available and that insurance requirements are met before forwarding to Accounts Payable for payment.

#### **Engineering Consultants**

The Bureau of Fiscal Audit performs pre-award evaluations for engineering agreements to ensure that agreements contain provisions for reimbursement that are in conformity with Authority and State Comptroller's guidelines.

The review includes direct salary rates, as well as expenses and indirect (Overhead or Multiplier) cost rates proposed, and approval of the firm's rates reported by a CPA firm or a NYSDOT approved overhead rate. Upon execution of an agreement, total contract amount, insurance requirements and work periods are set up and verified in Unifier. Staff coordinates the establishment of Project Accounting with the Budget Office. Assignment budgets approved by Engineering are set-up in Unifier and bills are processed against those budgets. Desk audits of the billings are performed on a continual basis, and audit adjustments are applied to future billings. Schedules documenting the reductions are provided to Authority program managers and consultants. Adjustments are recorded and posted thru Unifier.

#### **Other Consultants and Contractors**

The Authority leases office space for administrative operations in the Buffalo, Syracuse and New York Divisions. The Bureau of Fiscal Audit reviews annual escalation billings for operating costs and real estate tax increases submitted to the Authority from the landlord prior to payment. Staff also audits other Personal Service agreements in a manner like the Engineering agreements as described above. Fiscal Audit provides additional oversight and auditing of billings for services provided by the E-ZPass and Tolls by Mail Administrator managed jointly by the Authority's Department of Revenue Management with the Triborough Bridge and Tunnel Authority and the Port Authority of NY and NJ, and the Cashless Tolling System equipment vendor. These are very large and complex agreements. Other important contracts include those associated with provision of Fiber Optic maintenance and associated leasing of Authority-owned Fiber conduit.

## **State Agency Billings**

Audits are conducted of charges related to the cost of services provided by a variety of State agencies including the Office of the State Comptroller for pension contributions, and the Department of Civil Service for health insurance and employee benefits. Reconciliations and audits are performed as required.

#### Concessionaires

In 2020 the Authority Board approved a new 33-year agreement with Empire State Thruway Partners to rebuild 23 and renovate 4 of the 27 food concession locations over a three-year period. Construction, funded by Empire, began in July 2021 and several service areas are currently closed for restaurant services.

There are two Fuel service providers and one Food provider operating the Service Areas under four different contracts on the Thruway. Each concessionaire is responsible for a Minimum Annual Guaranteed Rent, a minimum percentage of sales spent on Renewal & Replacement of equipment at their facilities and must meet certain pricing and reporting requirements. The fuel operators must also comply with specified environmental regulations and procedures. Fiscal Audit verifies the compliance of each contract through monthly tracking of sales, spot price checks, year-end audits of sales and rent payments, inventory tracking, and Renewal & Replacement spending and issues reports. Incidents of noncompliance are reported to the proper unit and to other involved program managers for discussion, action to take and proposed resolutions.

## **Overall Risk Assessment of Billings and Contract Compliance**

Based on continuous audits of many contractual invoices, and the procedures that are in place to prevent inaccurate payments and non-compliance, controls are evaluated as being strong. The likelihood of some improper payments or non-compliance is moderate to high, and the likelihood that inaccurate payments or non-compliance could be material is low to moderate. Magnitude of impact on the Authority is assessed as moderate to high. Overall risk assessment for this area is moderate.

## Audit Area 4 – Asset Control

#### **Overview and Risk Identification**

The Thruway Authority has invested \$336.2 million in Equipment, Tools and Inventory, and therefore, it is important to monitor the controls to safeguard these assets. These assets are primarily controlled by the Office of Equipment and Inventory Management. This Office works closely with Division and Section staff to manage the location, usage, security and maintenance of these assets. These field supervisors are responsible and accountable for securing and maintaining these assets for their intended purposes.

Risks are based on the likelihood of Authority assets being lost, stolen, damaged or not used for Authority purposes. These failures could lead to increased replacement and repair costs, and potentially impact the completion of operational tasks if equipment is not available or not working.

#### Key Functions and Fiscal Audit Activities

#### Equipment

The Authority has purchased and maintains equipment with a cost of nearly \$303.7 million that is recorded in Property Records/Fixed Asset System. The approximate equipment costs by type are as follows:

Motorized - \$203.6 million - 67.0% State Police/Administrative Vehicles - \$6.4 million - 2.3% Shop/Office/Computer/Communications Eq. - \$20.9 million - 6.9% Software Projects and Patents (intangible asset) - \$39.2 million - 12.9% E-ZPass Tags - \$32.9 million - 10.8%

Section Staff, Division Staff, and HQ Managers are responsible for the assets assigned to their work unit or specific employees. The Bureau of Equipment and Inventory Management routinely inspects and maintains motorized and shop equipment. Fiscal Audit conducts field audits to verify the equipment assigned, review security of the assets, ensures that records are up to date and investigates variances and disposals. Audit reports document the audits and may include recommendations to ensure procedures are followed, and paperwork is processed to update the Fixed Assets System.

E-ZPass tags are purchased and depreciated over their life and reflect all Authority issued tags and inventory. The current toll administrator contract does not bill for systems equipment purchased, as pricing is based on service units. Some programming costs for development and changes as requested by the Authority may be capitalized as assets. This is typically for changes to tolling rates, discount plans, toll by mail accounts and web site changes.

## Tools

Thruway Tools (Tool Complements) assigned to employees have a cost of approximately \$6.6 million. There are 343 complements; \$4.1 million of the \$6.6 million are included in 42 of the complements. Tool Complement inventories are conducted annually by the Tool Complement Holder and are kept on file in Headquarters. An inventory is also done upon transfer of the complement from one employee to another, as well as on a sample basis by Fiscal Audit.

## Inventory

Inventory (including fuel, salt, auto parts, safety items, signs, toll equipment parts, etc) has a value of \$25.9 million. Salt inventory accounts for over 34% (\$8.7 million) of the total. Inventory is verified and updated annually by the respective Divisions, and adjustments are reported back to Headquarters, as well as reviewed and monitored by Fiscal Audit. Field audits are also conducted to verify the quantity of a sample of items on hand, which are compared to accounting records, to review that proper procedures are followed, updates and changes are made on a timely basis and to ensure security controls are in place.

## Checks, Purchasing Cards and Accounts Receivable

Various procedural controls are in place to ensure reliable, accurate and timely reporting of financial results. Some of the controls periodically reviewed and tested by Fiscal Audit are indicated below.

- the proper recording of transactions
- Procurement Card guidelines, including purchasing requirements
- supervisory review and authorization of various transactions and accounting entries
- Maintenance of supporting documentation
- Performance of reconciliations
- Identification of, and restricted access to, assets, including check stock, and controls over check printing and disbursement files
- Establishment of appropriate policies and procedures

## **Overall Risk Assessment of Asset Control**

Based on periodic audits of this area, controls in place to reduce or prevent the occurrence of lost, stolen, damaged or inappropriate use of Authority assets are moderate. The operating controls for the functions are distributed system-wide, to all supervisors responsible for equipment and inventory, making compliance testing protracted. P-Cards present the same challenge with 387 cards issued to employees' system-wide. While the likelihood of some inventory loss is moderate, the likelihood of material errors is low. The fiscal impact of these occurrences is low. The Overall Risk Assessment for this area is low.

#### **Overview and Risk Identification**

The Thruway Authority compensates their employees in accordance with the two negotiated labor agreements (Teamsters and CSEA) and Management Confidential guidelines and may receive memos from the Compensation Committee. Compensation and benefits are administered through the Office of Human Resource Management in the Department of Administrative Services, and through the Payroll Unit in the Office of Accounting & Disbursements in the Department of Finance & Accounts. In 2023, employee compensation and benefits totaled approximately \$207 million.

Risks are based on the likelihood that inaccurate salary payments are made, fringe benefits are administered incorrectly or inaccurately paid, co-payments for health insurance coverage are incorrect, and employees' time, attendance & labor gets misreported. These failures could lead to lost dollars (overpayments not recovered), labor costs to correct errors, and inaccurate payroll, attendance and maintenance cost records.

#### Key Functions and Fiscal Audit Activities

#### **Employee Compensation**

The Bureau of Fiscal Audit conducts many different audits to verify and ensure the accuracy of the Authority's employee compensation throughout the year. Fiscal Audit performs pre-implementation reviews of salary raises and step advances, as well as assists in the calculation and verification of retroactive salary payments when necessary. Payments in accordance with negotiated labor agreements for vacation buy back, health insurance opt-outs, non-use of sick leave incentives, and snow and ice availability payments are also audited prior to payment, whether annually or bi-annually. Additionally, each year, randomly selected work units are chosen for Field Audits, in which various reviews and verifications are made to ensure employees are working appropriately or charge leave accruals, salaries are accurate, timecards, work orders and attendance records are completed and authorized. Overall payroll controls are also reviewed to ensure that all employees are paid appropriately.

#### Health Insurance and Other Fringe Benefits

Fiscal Audit performs annual pre-implementation audits of the new health insurance rates to verify that the Human Resource Management System (HRMS) is updated with correct rates and Authority employees' contributions are accurate. Health insurance for active employees is administered through the Office of Human Resources (HR), while health insurance for retirees is administered through the NYS Dept of Civil Service. The HR office is responsible for reviewing and approving the monthly billing for active employees. Periodically, Fiscal Audit performs a comparison of the active employees list versus the monthly bill to verify changes are made on a timely basis and reviews billings. Other billings and payments may be reviewed or audited on a post payment basis, and adjustments, if necessary, are done to correct errors.

## **Time and Attendance**

Fiscal Audit verifies the accuracy of employee rosters and attendance through verification of employees assigned to work in the field. Each employee on duty provides identification and a signature, which is then compared to payroll records on file in the Payroll Office.

The time & attendance and labor records for several randomly selected work units are reviewed every year through Field audits. Workers are required to use a time clock, key card or complete other records to report their work hours. A record of the labor by work type, and overtime, shift training or other hours are input into the Kronos Timekeeper system, and after supervisory approval, all work units electronically submit this information to the Payroll Office. Timekeeper interfaces with various maintenance reporting systems that are used by Management to accumulate project costs and maintain accurate accounting records. Supervisors and managers are held accountable for the accuracy of records, overtime payments and work accomplished.

#### **Overall Risk Assessment Salary and Benefits – Employees and Retirees**

Based on periodic audits of this area, controls are in place to monitor and prevent system overpayments. The likelihood of failure of the controls and impact to overall operations is low to moderate. Overall risk assessment for this area is low.

## **Bureau of Fiscal Audit** 2024 Preliminary Report Accomplishments

Summarized below are highlights of the audit activities during 2024.

## **Revenues and Reimbursements**

Cashless Tolling Revenues & Reimbursements: In the 1<sup>st</sup> Quarter 2024 the Authority's new customer service center vendor, TTEC, and new tag distributor, Transcore L.P. went live after a multi-year implementation. Fiscal Audit staff continued review and evaluation to refine audit programs for Cashless Toll Collection in an effort to mitigate revenue loss.

FEMA & FHWA Reimbursements: As the result of accumulating, tracking and properly segregating disaster costs, over \$534k in federal funding was collected on FEMA & FHWA projects during 2024. The payments received relate to claims on the Thruway system for emergency responses to November 2022 Buffalo Snowstorm (EM-3589), December 2022 Buffalo Snowstorm (DR-4694), 2023 July Flooding (DR-4723) and 2023 September Flooding (DR-4755). Reimbursement of projects obligated by FEMA DR-4694, DR-4723, and DR-4755, are still in process for approximately \$68k. Anticipated reimbursements of over \$1.5 million for projects not yet obligated under DR-4694, Hurricane Debby (DR-4825), and COVID-19 (DR-4480) are currently being reviewed by FEMA for eligibility. There are no new FEMA identified disasters that have not been addressed by the Authority.

Service Area Reconstruction: The 27 service area restaurant buildings are being redeveloped as part of a \$450 million investment plan with Empire State Thruway Partners. Empire will rebuild 23 of the 27 service area restaurant buildings and perform significant renovations to the remaining four. Fiscal audit has continued to review concessions rentals, renewal and replacement expenditures and environmental remediation projects for the currently operating food and fuel service operators.

## Financial Reporting & Regulatory Compliance

Fiscal Audit continues to assist with review and preparation of financial reports. The objective of these reviews is to detect and correct errors in our financial statements prior to being issued monthly and for year-end independent auditor's review. Additionally, the annual Public Authorities Data Request continues to be submitted to the NYS Division of Budget (DOB) in compliance with their requirements.

## **Billings and Contract Compliance**

Through November 2024, audit staff has reviewed and processed approximately 827 billings totaling nearly \$125.5 million for consultants and other contracts. In addition, staff performed audits of billings in accordance with the contracts that resulted in approximately \$64,000 of reductions or adjustments for amounts billed that were not in accordance with the contract or missing supporting documentation. In June 2024, the Authority transitioned from its in-house supported Contract Management System (CMS) to an Oracle Primavera System (Unifier). Audit

staff assisted with the manual migration of data between systems during a two-week period the processing of payments was put on hold. Staff was also involved in preliminary discussions and testing of processes in the new system. Efforts to improve and enhance Unifier continue.

## **E-ZPass and Tolls by Mail – Toll Administrator Agreements**

Fiscal Audit continued assistance with current back-office vendor management and the implementation phase of three new agreements for the next generation of Electronic Toll Collection and Cashless, Open Road Tolling. Services currently provided under a single contract are being split into three separate long-term contracts for provision of Systems and License Plate and Owner Identification Services, E-ZPass Tag Distribution, and Customer Contact Center. Fiscal Audit staff has continued to audit and track the billings related to the maintenance of the AET equipment installed on the gantries and toll collection software.

## Asset Control

Continued performing system-wide audits of motorized and shop equipment to meet goal of auditing all locations within a three-year rolling time frame. These audits are performed by auditors visiting Authority maintenance sites, facilities and other inventory items and tool complements are also performed during these visits. These audits assist in maintaining accurate fixed asset listings and verify proper procedures are followed.

## Salary and Benefits – Employees and Retirees

Fiscal Audit staff continued audits to verify bonus sick and sick leave incentive payments, health insurance rates, retirement contributions, health insurance billings, snow & ice availability payments and other negotiated benefits prior to payment. In addition, pre-audited retroactive payments due to Unit 2 employees based on the new bargaining agreement ratified in November 2023.

## Bureau of Fiscal Audit 2021-2023 Accomplishments

A summary of the audit reports issued, control functions performed and staff allocation for the audit staff of the Bureau of Fiscal Audit for 2021-2023 is summarized below by audit area. Enclosed are tables for each year listing the audits performed by audit area and key function.

## **Revenues and Reimbursements**

Over the three-year period an average of 82 reports were issued per year accounting for 38% of staff time. Verification of financial transactions reported to the Authority from our E-ZPass and Tolls by Mail vendor remained a high priority with emphasis on the transition from cash collection audits to cashless tolling audits. The system wide cashless tolling conversion was completed in November 2020. During the subsequent three-year period audit staff completed outstanding cash collection and individual toll collector audits and developed new audits pertaining to the new system of toll collection.

## Financial Reporting & Regulatory Compliance

Over the three-year period an average of 17 reports were issued per year accounting for 8% of staff time. The objective of these reports is to detect and correct errors in our financial statements prior to issuing and our independent auditor's review. Reporting requirements for long term liabilities for health insurance and pension costs have been incorporated into our financial reporting. The Authority continues to receive an unqualified opinion regarding our financial statements and the latest management letter reports no outstanding items. Additionally, the annual Public Authorities Data Request continues to be submitted to DOB in compliance with their requirements.

#### **Billings and Contract Compliance**

Over the three-year period an average of 181 reports were issued per year accounting for 26% of staff time. Over the three-year period staff reviewed billings from consultants and conducted contract compliance activities in order to process payments and make audit reductions for amounts billed that were not in accordance with the contract or missing supporting documentation. Staff allocation is driven by volume/dollars of billings processed. All newly awarded Architectural and Engineering agreements are subject to a pre-award evaluation. This evaluation by audit staff ensures that proposed salary, overhead and profit rates are in accordance with Authority guidelines.

Staff within the E-ZPass and AET financial management unit continued to contribute to oversight associated with conversion from cash tolling to all-electronic tolling. These very large Personal Service type agreements provide back-office payment and toll transaction processing, in-lane transaction generation and collections revenue payment processing.

## Asset Control

Over the three-year period an average of 64 reports were issued per year accounting for 12% of staff time. Motorized and shop equipment field audits are performed at a select number of Thruway locations. These audits are targeted to assets with high value, location reassignment, obsolescence or significant replacement and in areas where there have been supervisory staff turnover or system tracking procedure changes.

## Salary and Benefits – Employees and Retirees

Over the three-year period an average of 26 reports were issued per year accounting for 16% of staff time. The audits review and verify salary raises, sick leave benefit payments, health insurance rates, retiree health insurance billings and other benefits prior to implementation and payment. Over the three-year period, audit staff has conducted payroll/personnel timekeeper compliance audits at 15 of the 25 field maintenance reporting locations.

## Audit Accomplishments Number of Audits Performed & Resource Allocation 2021 - 2023

	Area 1		Are	a 2	Are	ea 3	Are	ea 4	Are	ea 5	To	otal
		Revenue & Financial Reporting & Reimbursements Regulatory Compliance		atory	Billings & Contract Compliance		Asset Control		Salary & Benefits - Employees & Retiree's			
Year	Audits	Hours	Audits	Hours	Audits	Hours	Audits	Hours	Audits	Hours	Audits	Hours
2021	88	4,267	25	1,015	185	2,350	44	765	22	1,589	364	9,986
2022	100	3,130	19	781	176	2,028	60	1,124	30	851	385	7,914
2023	59	2,159	7	283	183	2,156	89	1,244	25	1,487	363	7,329
Total	247	9,556	51	2,079	544	6,534	193	3,133	77	3,927	1,112	25,229
Average	82	3,185	17	693	181	2,178	64	1,044	26	1,309	371	8,410
Percentage of Total Resources	37.	88%	8.2	4%	25.9	90%	12.	42%	15.	57%	100	.00%

#### 2021 Audit Accomplishments Audit Categories and Counts New York State Thruway Authority

Audit Area	Category Description	Audit Category Number	Resource Allocation (Number of Audits)	2021 Actual Audits Performed	Resource Allocation (Hours)	
Area 1 - Re E-ZPass	venues & Reimbursements s:					
	Reserved for Projects - New Vendor Back Office Agreement	1 1A	2	1	265	
	Collections Revenue reconciliation -Vendor Reported Comp	1 1B	1	1	35	
	NYS Bridge Authority Quarterly Chargeback Billings	1 1C	4	17	228.25	
	Credit Card Quarterly Chargeback Billings	1 1D	4	5	207	
	Annual State Police E-ZPass tag billing	1 1E	1	1	1.5	
	VDOT Annual IAG Fees Billing	1 1F	1	1	25	
	Violations Processing and Revenue Recovery from Collection	1 1G	1	1	35	
	Niagara Frontier Bridge Commission Tag Packages	1 1H	1			
	Peace Bridge Quarterly Chargeback Billings	1 11	4	1	8.5	
	Thousand Island Bridge Authority Quarterly Chargeback Bill	1 1J	4	1	8.5	
	Rejected Transactions Review	1 1K	12	3	179	
	Negative Account Balance Review	1 1L	12			
	°		47	32	992.75	9.94%
Tolls By	/ Mail:					1
	Monthly TBM Revenue Entries	1 2A	12	11	295.5	
	Monthly Review of Wire Transfers	1 2B	12	12	222.5	
	Monthly Review of Accounts Receivable	1 2C	12			
	Violations Revenue and Fees Recovery	1 2D	12			
	RESERVED	1 2E	As needed	4	355	
	Toll System Transaction Audits Comparison to Vendor	1 2F	12			
	Video Classification Audits	1 2G	24			
	Rejected Video Transaction Audits	1 2H	24	20	480	
	RESERVED	1 21	As needed	1	63.25	
	Audit of Station Funds - Final Disposition	1 2J	1			
	Special Projects - Integrate BOTs to Reporting for VTM etc	1 2K	1			
	Special Projects - New Toll Rates (January 2022)	1 2L	1	1	180.5	
	Special Projects - New Resident Discount Plan	1 2M	1			
	. ,		112	49	1596.75	15.99%
Conces	sion Revenue:					1
	Service Station Rentals	1 3A	2	1	123	
	Service Station - Other	1 3B	As needed			
	Restaurant Rentals	1 3C	3			
	Restaurant - Other	1 3D	As needed			
			5	1	123	1.23%
Federal	Disaster Assistance, Claims & Grants					1
	FEMA/FHWA Thruway	1 4A	2	5	145.5	
	FEMA/FHWA Canal (closeouts of previous awards)	1 4B	2			
	Grants - Miscellaneous	1 4C	As needed			
		-	4	5	145.5	1.46%
Other:	Reserved for Special Projects - Revenues and Reimbursem	1 4D	As needed	1	1408.75	14.11%
	Area 1		168	88	4266.75	42.73%

Audit Area	Category Description	Audit Category Number	Resource Allocation (Number of Audits)	2021 Actual Audits Performed	Resource Allocation (Hours)	
Area 2 - Finai	ncial Reporting & Regulatory Compliance				(	1
Financial S	Statement Review:					
A	Annual Audit Plan For Thruway Board	2 1A	1	1	70.5	l
	E-ZPass and Tolls By Mail Expenses & Budget Review	2 1B	1	2	60	
	Review of Audited Financial Statements, Notes & External A	2 1C	1	1	138.75	
	Pre-Audit of Monthly Financial Statements	2 1D	12	15	393	
	Assist Accounting Year End Estimated Liability for Environm Assist Accounting Year End Contract Liability set-ups	2 1E 2 1F	1	2 2	44 208.5	
	Assist Accounting Year End Vacation Liability	2 1G	1	1	200.5	
,		210	18	24	934.75	
Regulatory	y Reporting:					•
	State Comprehensive Annual Financial Report (PARIS)	2 2A	1			
	Procurement Reports for Thruway Board	2 2B	1	1	79.75	
	State Comptroller's Audit Report Review	2 2C	As needed			
F	RESERVED for Other Regulatory Reporting	2 2D	As needed 2	1	79.75	
Confirmati	ons & Reconciliations		2	-	79.75	•
	nvestments & Collateral	2 3B	1			
A	Accounts Receivable	2 3C	1			
			2			
_						
Total - Are	ea 2		22	25	1014.5	
Area 3 - Billin	igs & Contract Compliance					
<b>•</b> "						
Consultan		2.14	20	10	399	
	Audit of Monthly Billings - E-ZPass & AET/TBM Operations Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Office Audits	3 1A 3 1B	28 150	19 47	399 720.25	
	Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Onice Addits	3 1C	2	47	120.25	
	Pre-Award Audits Engineering - D Contracts	3 1D	10	27	321.75	
	Contractor's Claims	3 1E	As needed			
	Processing Contract Payments (est. 600) Pre-Payment Aud	3 1F	As needed			
	ease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts)	3 1G	4	4	55	
	Aisc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, S	3 1H	10	15	84.25	
	egal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts	3 1I 3 1J	15 4	18	125.75	
	Real Estate Appraisal billings - C Contracts Jtilities & Municipal Agreements	3 1J 3 1K	4 5	12	6.75 75.25	
	Railroads / Force Agreements	3 1L	2	7	32.5	
•		0 IL	230	150	1820.5	
Governme	ental Agencies:					
0	Department of Law	3 2A	As needed			
	Office of the State Comptroller Billing	3 2B	As needed			
	Department of Civil Service Administration	3 2C	2	2	12	
	NYS Retirement System Billing	3 2D	1	1	34	
	State Police Troop T Payroll (Quarterly) State Police Troop T Non-Personal Service costs	3 2E 3 2F	4	4	33 90	
	Department of Labor Unemployment Insurance	3 2F	1	1	49.75	
L	eparament of Labor Onomploymont mouldido	020	9	9	218.75	4

Audit Area Category Description	Audit Category Number	Resource Allocation (Number of Audits)	2021 Actual Audits Performed	Resource Allocation (Hours)	
Concessions: Concessionaire Agreements - Repair & Replacement, Cap I	3 3A	3	5	100.5	
Concessionaire Agreements - Gas Pricing Review Fuel Service Facilities - Remediations Ongoing	3 3B 3 3C	2 20	12	117	
Other: Assistance to Other Units - Review of RFPs and Draft Contr	3 4A	2 27	9 <b>26</b>	93.5 <b>311</b>	3.11%
Total - Area 3		266	185	2350.25	23.54%
Area 4 - Asset Control		200	105	2330.23	23.3470
Equipment: FIELD AUDITS					
Motorized Equipment	4 1A	8	4	63.5	
Office/Computer Equipment	4 1B	4	2	70	
Shop Equipment	4 1C	5	3	54.25	
Communications Equipment Inventory	4 1D	1			
Toll Equipment	4 1E	As needed	_		
Tool Complements & Controls	4 1F 4 1G	5	7	52.5	
Scrapping or Surplus Assets	4 IG	1 24	16	240.25	2.41%
Inventory:			10	240.20	2.4170
Fuel Inventory Reconciliation	4 2A	1			
Reconcile Inventories - Division Stores (4 Divisions & Sign S		5	8	126	
Section Stores Inventory Verification	4 2C	7	9	176	
HQ Supplies Inventory Verification	4 2D	As needed	17	302	2.020/
Cash, Checks, Credit cards and Accounts Receiveable:		13	17	302	3.02%
Procurement Card Audits	4 3A	4			
Account Receivable Confirmations	4 3B	1			
Account Receiveable Reconciliation	4 3C	3			
Cash Funds (petty cash and change funds)	4 3D	4			
Check Signing reconcilliation	4 3E	12	11	222.75	
Check stock replacement & check register	4 3F	2 26	11	222.75	2.23%
Total - Area 4		63	44	765	7.66%
Area 5 - Salary & Benefits - Employees & Retirees Employee Compensation (Payroll & Negotiated Benefits) Salary Raises/Step Advances Retroactive Salary or Contractual Payments (Call-out Incent Vacation Buyback	5 1A 5 1B 5 1C 5 1D	2 2 1 1 4	3 3 1 4	872.25 314.5 41.25 138.5	

Audit Area	Category Description	Audit Category Number	Resource Allocation (Number of Audits)	2021 Actual Audits Performed	Resource Allocation (Hours)	
Health Ins	surance & Other Fringe Benefits:					
I	Pre-Implementation Audit of Health Insurance Rates	5 2A	1	1	37.5	
I	Reconciliation of TWY Health Insurance Enrollees	5 2B	1			
I	Jnemployment Billings Review	5 2C	As needed			
:	Survivor's Benefit	5 2D	4	3	15	
			6	4	52.5	0.53%
Time & At	tendance: Field Audits					
	Head Counts	5 3A	1			
1	Nightime Audits of Winter Maint.	5 3B	1			
	Verification of Seasonal Employees	5 3C	1			
	Verification of Timekeeper Records	5 3D	4	6	70.25	
			7	6	70.25	0.70%
Total - Ar	rea 5		25	22	1589.25	15.92%
TOTAL A	LL CATEGORIES		544	364	9985.75	100.00%

#### 2022 Audit Accomplishments Audit Categories and Counts New York State Thruway Authority

udit Area	Category Description	Audit Category Number	Resource Allocation (Number of Audits)	2022 Actual Audits Performed	Resource Allocation (Hours)	
rea 1 - Revenu E-ZPas	ues & Reimbursements s:					
	Reserved for Projects - Credit Card Processing Vendor Review	1 1A	1			
	Quarterly Collections Customer Payments Vendor To Vendor Reco	1 1B	4	3	43	
	NYS Bridge Authority Quarterly Chargeback Billings	1 1C	4	5	158	
	Credit Card Quarterly Chargeback Billings	1 1D	4	7	220	
	Annual State Police E-ZPass tag billing	1 1E	1	1	2	
	VDOT Annual IAG Fees Billing	1 1F	1	1	25	
	Collections Vendor Revenue Remittance & Reporting	1 1G	4	18	94	
	Niagara Frontier Bridge Commission Tag Packages	1 1H	1	1	3	
	Peace Bridge Quarterly Chargeback Billings	1 11	4	5	-	
	Thousand Island Bridge Authority Quarterly Chargeback Billings	1 1J	4	5	43	
	Quarterly Rejected Transactions Review	1 16 1 1K	4	3	-	
	Negative Account Balance Review	1 1L	12	1	70	
	Negative Account Dalance Neview		44	50	708	8.95%
Tolls By	/ Mail <sup>.</sup>				700	0.0070
Tono Dy	Monthly TBM Revenue Entries	1 2A	12	13	337	
	Monthly Review of Wire Transfers	1 2B	12	12		
	Quarterly Review of TBM Accounts Receivable	1 2C	4	0	0	
	Violations Revenue and Fees Recovery	1 2D	12	0	0	
	Gantry Image Quality	1 2E	12	0		
	Toll System Transaction Audits Comparison Gantry to Vendor	1 2E	12	12	-	
	Video Classification Audits N1 and Random Audit	1 2F	24	8	216	
	Rejected Video Transaction Audits - Images, DMV	1 2G	24 24	0	210	
	RESERVED	1 21	As needed	0	0	
	Audit of Discount Plans	1 2J	As needed 6	0	0	
		1 2J 1 2K	1	0	0	
	Special Projects - Integrate BOTs		12	0	-	
	Monthly Conduent Status Audit	1 2L 1 2M		0	0	
	Special Projects - Toll Rate Changes, Non-Rev, etc.	I ZIVI	6 137	45 0	821	10.37%
Canada	sion Revenue:		13/	40	021	10.37 %
Conces	Son Revenue. Service Station Rentals	1 3A	2	2	150	
	Service Station - Other	1 3A 1 3B	As needed	2 0		
	Restaurant Rentals	1 3C	As needed	0	0	
	Restaurant - Review of New Restaurant Construction	1 3D	1	0	0	
			4	2	150	1.90%
Federal	Disaster Assistance, Claims & Grants			<u> </u>	130	1.30 /0
reuerdi	FEMA/FHWA Thruwav	1 4A	6	2	51	
	FEMA/FHWA Canal (closeouts of previous awards)	1 4A 1 4B	2	2 0		
	Grants - Miscellaneous	1 4D 1 4C	As needed	0	-	
		- +0	As needed 8	2	51	0.64%
Other:	Reserved for Special Projects - Revenues and Reimbursements	1 4D	As needed	1	1400	
			0	1	1400	17.69%
Total - A	Area 1		193	100	3130	39.55%

udit Area	Category Description	Audit Category Number	Resource Allocation (Number of Audits)	2022 Actual Audits Performed	Resource Allocation (Hours)	
rea 2 - Financi	al Reporting & Regulatory Compliance					
Financia	I Statement Review:					
	Annual Audit Plan For Thruway Board	2 1A	1	1	39	
	E-ZPass and Tolls By Mail Expenses & Budget Review	2 1B	1	0	0	
	Review of Audited Financial Statements, Notes & External Auditor	2 1C	1	1	104	
	Pre-Audit of Monthly Financial Statements	2 1D	12	12	231	
	Assist Accounting Year End Estimated Liability for Environmental (	2 1E	1	1	38	
	Assist Accounting Year End Contract Liability set-ups - Operating	2 1F	1	2	272	
	Assist Accounting Year End Vacation Liability	2 1G	1	1	30	
	Assist Accounting Year End Contract Liability set-ups - Capital	2 1H	1	0	0	
			19	18	714	9.02%
Regulate	ory Reporting:					
	RESERVED for Other Regulatory Reporting	2 2A	As needed			
	Annual Public Authority Data Request (PARIS)/Board	2 2B	1	1	67	
	State Comptroller's Audit Report Review	2 2C	As needed			
			1	1	67	0.85%
Confirm	ations & Reconciliations					
	Investments & Collateral	2 3B	1	0	0	
	Accounts Receivable	2 3C	1	0	0	
			2	0	0	0.00%
Total - A	Area 2		22	19	781	9.87%
ea 3 - Billings Consulta	s & Contract Compliance					
	Audit of Monthly Billings - Toll Collection Related	3 1A	28	22	454	
	Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Office Audits	3 1B	125	73	897	
	Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Field Audits	3 1C	2	0	0	
	Pre-Award Audits Engineering - D Contracts	3 1D	10	10	94	
	Contractor's Claims	3 1E				
		012	As needed			
	Processing Contract Payments (est. 600) Pre-Payment Audit	3 1F	As needed			
	Processing Contract Payments (est. 600) Pre-Payment Audit Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts)			4	74	
	Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety,	3 1F	1	4 20	74 116	
	Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts)	3 1F 3 1G	1 4	-		
	Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety,	3 1F 3 1G 3 1H	1 4 15	20	116 49 7	
	Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Legal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts Real Estate Appraisal billings - C Contracts Utilities & Municipal Agreements	3 1F 3 1G 3 1H 3 1I	1 4 15 15	20 12 1 6	116 49 7 23	
	Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Legal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts Real Estate Appraisal billings - C Contracts	3 1F 3 1G 3 1H 3 1I 3 1J	1 4 15 15 4 5 2	20 12 1	116 49 7	
	Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Legal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts Real Estate Appraisal billings - C Contracts Utilities & Municipal Agreements Railroads / Force Agreements	3 1F 3 1G 3 1H 3 1I 3 1J 3 1J 3 1K	1 4 15 15 4 5	20 12 1 6	116 49 7 23	22.23%
Governr	Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Legal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts Real Estate Appraisal billings - C Contracts Utilities & Municipal Agreements Railroads / Force Agreements nental Agencies:	3 1F 3 1G 3 1H 3 1I 3 1J 3 1J 3 1K	1 4 15 15 4 5 2 <b>211</b>	20 12 1 6 5	116 49 7 23 45	22.23%
Governr	Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Legal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts Real Estate Appraisal billings - C Contracts Utilities & Municipal Agreements Railroads / Force Agreements	3 1F 3 1G 3 1H 3 1I 3 1J 3 1K 3 1K 3 1L 3 2A	1 4 15 15 4 5 2	20 12 1 6 5	116 49 7 23 45	22.23%
Governr	Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Legal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts Real Estate Appraisal billings - C Contracts Utilities & Municipal Agreements Railroads / Force Agreements nental Agencies:	3 1F 3 1G 3 1H 3 1I 3 1J 3 1K 3 1L	1 4 15 15 4 5 2 <b>211</b>	20 12 1 6 5	116 49 7 23 45	22.23%
Governr	Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Legal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts Real Estate Appraisal billings - C Contracts Utilities & Municipal Agreements Railroads / Force Agreements nental Agencies: Department of Law	3 1F 3 1G 3 1H 3 1I 3 1J 3 1K 3 1K 3 1L 3 2A	1 4 15 15 4 5 2 <b>211</b> As needed	20 12 1 6 5	116 49 7 23 45	22.23%
Governr	Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Legal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts Real Estate Appraisal billings - C Contracts Utilities & Municipal Agreements Railroads / Force Agreements nental Agencies: Department of Law Office of the State Comptroller Billing	3 1F 3 1G 3 1H 3 1I 3 1J 3 1K 3 1K 3 1L 3 2A 3 2B	1 4 15 15 4 5 2 <b>211</b> As needed As needed	20 12 1 6 5	116 49 7 23 45 <b>1759</b> 16 10	22.23%
Governr	Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Legal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts Real Estate Appraisal billings - C Contracts Utilities & Municipal Agreements Railroads / Force Agreements nental Agencies: Department of Law Office of the State Comptroller Billing Department of Civil Service Administration	3 1F 3 1G 3 1H 3 1J 3 1J 3 1K 3 1K 3 1L 3 2A 3 2B 3 2C	1 4 15 15 4 5 2 <b>211</b> As needed As needed 2	20 12 1 6 5	116 49 7 23 45 <b>1759</b> 16	22.23%
Governr	Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Legal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts Real Estate Appraisal billings - C Contracts Utilities & Municipal Agreements Railroads / Force Agreements nental Agencies: Department of Law Office of the State Comptroller Billing Department of Civil Service Administration NYS Retirement System Billing	3 1F 3 1G 3 1H 3 1J 3 1J 3 1K 3 1L 3 2A 3 2B 3 2C 3 2D	1 4 15 15 4 5 2 <b>211</b> As needed As needed 2 1	20 12 1 6 5	116 49 7 23 45 <b>1759</b> 16 10	22.23%
Governr	Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Legal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts Real Estate Appraisal billings - C Contracts Utilities & Municipal Agreements Railroads / Force Agreements mental Agencies: Department of Law Office of the State Comptroller Billing Department of Civil Service Administration NYS Retirement System Billing State Police Troop T Payroll (Quarterly)	3 1F 3 1G 3 1H 3 1J 3 1J 3 1K 3 1L 3 2A 3 2B 3 2C 3 2D 3 2E	1 4 15 15 4 5 2 <b>211</b> As needed As needed 2 1 4	20 12 1 6 5	116 49 7 23 45 <b>1759</b> 16 10 56	22.23%

Audit Are	ea Category Description	Audit Category Number	Resource Allocation (Number of Audits)	2022 Actual Audits Performed	Resource Allocation (Hours)	
	Concessions:		Addits	Fenomea	(nours)	
	Concessionaire Agreements - Repair & Replacement, Cap Imp	. 3 3A	2	1	17	
	Concessionaire Agreements - Gas Pricing Review	3 3B	2	0	0	
	Fuel Service Facilities - Remediations Ongoing	3 3C	12	10	33	
	Tuel Service Facilities - Remediations Origonity	3 30	12	10		
C	Other: Assistance to Other Units - Review of RFPs and Draft Contract	s, E 3 4A	2	2	56	
-		-,	18	13	106	1.34%
_						
	Fotal - Area 3		238	176	2028	25.63%
Area 4 - A	Asset Control					
F	Equipment: FIELD AUDITS					
L	Motorized Equipment	4 1A	16	0	0	
			-	-	-	
	Office/Computer Equipment	4 1B	8	9	427	
	Shop Equipment	4 1C	5	1	9	
	Communications Equipment Inventory	4 1D	1	0	0	
	Toll Equipment	4 1E	As needed	0	0	
	Tool Complements & Controls	4 1F	5	18	165	
	Scrapping or Surplus Assets	4 1G	1	0		
	Octapping of Outpids Associa	4 10	36	28	601	7.59%
1.	nventory:		50	20	001	1.55 /6
11	,	4 00			0	
	Fuel Inventory Reconciliation	4 2A	1	0	0	
	Reconcile Inventories - Division Stores (4 Divisions & Sign Sho		5	12	234	
	Section Stores Inventory Verification	4 2C	7	7	60	
	HQ Supplies Inventory Verification	4 2D	As needed	0	0	
			13	19	294	3.71%
C	Cash, Checks, Credit cards and Accounts Receiveable:					
	Procurement Card Audits	4 3A	4	0	0	
	Account Receivable Confirmations	4 3B	1	0	-	
	Account Receiveable Reconciliation	4 3C	1	0	0	
			5	0	0	
	Cash Funds (petty cash and change funds)	4 3D	-	-	-	
	Check Signing reconcilliation	4 3E	12	13	229	
			23	13	229	2.89%
Т	Fotal - Area 4		72	60	1124	14.20%
						1412070
Area 5 - S	Salary & Benefits - Employees & Retirees					
E	Employee Compensation (Payroll & Negotiated Benefits)					
	Salary Raises/Step Advances	5 1A	2	3	365	
	Retroactive Salary or Contractual Payments (Call-out Incentive	) 5 1B	2	1	99	
	Vacation Buyback	5 1C	1	1	23	
	Health Insurance Opt-out	5 1D	1		35	
	Semi-Annual Incentive & Bonus for Non-use Sick Leave	5 1D	4		35 114	
		-	-	4	114	
	Payoff & Comparison of Payroll to Roster	5 1F	1			
	Commuter Use of TWY Provided Vehicles	5 1G	1	1	100	
			12	11	736	9.30%

Audit Area	Category Description	Audit Category Number	Resource Allocation (Number of Audits)	2022 Actual Audits Performed	Resource Allocation (Hours)	
Health	Insurance & Other Fringe Benefits:					
	Pre-Implementation Audit of Health Insurance Rates	5 2A	1	1	38	
	Reconciliation of TWY Health Insurance Enrollees	5 2B	1	0	0	
	Unemployment Billings Review	5 2C	As needed	0	0	
	Survivor's Benefit	5 2D	4	4	10	
			6	5	48	0.61%
Time &	Attendance: Field Audits					
	Head Counts	5 3A	1			
	Nightime Audits of Winter Maint.	5 3B	0			
	Verification of Seasonal Employees	5 3C	1			
	Verification of Timekeeper Records	5 3D	8	14	67	
	·		10	14	67	0.85%
Total -	Area 5		28	30	851	10.75%
TOTAL	_ ALL CATEGORIES		553	385	7914	100.00%

#### 2023 Audit Accomplishments Audit Categories and Counts New York State Thruway Authority

ıdit Area	Category Description	Audit Category Number	Resource Allocation (Number of Audits)	2023 Actual Audits Performed	Resource Allocation (Hours)	
	nues & Reimbursements					
E-ZPa	SS:					
	Reserved for Special Projects - Revenues and Reimbursements	1 1A	As needed	0	0	
	Monthly Collections Customer Payments Vendor To Vendor Reconciliation	1 1B	4	4	99	
	NYS Bridge Authority Quarterly Chargeback Billings	1 1C	4	3	106.5	
	Credit Card Quarterly Chargeback Billings	1 1D	4	0	0	
	Annual State Police E-ZPass tag billing	1 1E	1	1	1.5	
	VDOT Annual IAG Fees Billing	1 1F	1	0	0	
	Collections Vendor Revenue Remittance & Reporting	1 1G	12	16	52.5	
	Niagara Frontier Bridge Commission Tag Packages	1 1H	1	1	3	
	Peace Bridge Quarterly Chargeback Billings	1 11	4	4	34	
	Thousand Island Bridge Authority Quarterly Chargeback Billings	1 1J	4	4	34	
	Quarterly Rejected Transactions Review	1 1K	4	4	40	
	Negative Account Balance Review	1 1L	12	7	49	
			51	44	419.5	5.72%
Tolls B	y Mail:					
	Monthly TBM Revenue Entries	1 2A	12	4	83	
	Monthly Review of Wire Transfers	1 2B	12	4	72.25	
	Quarterly Review of TBM Accounts Receivable	1 2C	4	0	0	
	Violations Revenue and Fees Recovery	1 2D	12	0	0	
	Gantry Image Quality	1 2E	12	0	0	
	Toll System Transaction Audits Comparison Gantry to Vendor	1 2F	12	4	14.25	
	Video Classification Audits N1 and Random Audit	1 2G	24	0	0	
	Rejected Video Transaction Audits - Images, DMV	1 2H	24	0	0	
	RESERVED	1 21	As needed	0	0	
	Audit of Discount Plans	1 2J	6	0	0	
	Special Projects - Integrate BOTs	1 2K	1	0	0	
	Monthly Conduent Status Audit	1 2L	12	0	0	
	Special Projects - Toll Rate Changes, Non-Rev, etc.	1 2M	6	0	1400	
			137	12	1569.5	21.42
Conce	ssion Revenue:					
	Service Station Rentals	1 3A	2	2	156	
	Service Station - Other	1 3B	As needed	0	0	1
	Restaurant Rentals	1 3C	1	0	0	
	Restaurant - Review of New Restaurant Construction	1 3D	1	0	0	
			4	2	156	2.13%
Federa	al Disaster Assistance, Claims & Grants					
	FEMA/FHWA Thruway	1 4A	6	1	14	
	FEMA/FHWA Canal (closeouts of previous awards)	1 4B	2	0	0	1
	Grants - Miscellaneous	1 4C	As needed	0	0	
			8	1	14	0.19%
Total	Area 1		200	59	2159	29.46%

idit Area	Category Description	Audit Category Number	Resource Allocation (Number of Audits)	2023 Actual Audits Performed	Resource Allocation (Hours)	
ea 2 - Financ	cial Reporting & Regulatory Compliance					
Financi	ial Statement Review:					
	Annual Audit Plan For Thruway Board E-ZPass and Tolls By Mail Expenses & Budget Review Review of Audited Financial Statements, Notes & External Auditor's Reports Pre-Audit of Monthly Financial Statements Assist Accounting Year End Estimated Liability for Environmental Claims Assist Accounting Year End Contract Liability set-ups - Operating Assist Accounting Year End Vacation Liability Assist Accounting Year End Contract Liability set-ups - Capital	2 1A 2 1B 2 1C 2 1D 2 1E 2 1F 2 1G 2 1H	1 1 12 1 1 1 1 1	0 0 3 1 1 1 0	0 0 62.75 37.5 128 30 0	
			19	6	258.25	3.52%
Regula	tory Reporting: RESERVED for Other Regulatory Reporting Annual Public Authority Data Request (PARIS)/Board State Comptroller's Audit Report Review	2 2A 2 2B 2 2C	As needed 1 As needed 1	0 1 0 <b>1</b>	0 25 0 <b>25</b>	0.34%
Confirm	nations & Reconciliations					
	Investments & Collateral Accounts Receivable	2 3B 2 3C	1 1 2	0 0 0	0 0 <b>0</b>	0.00%
Total	A		22	7	202.25	2.00%
Total -	Area 2			7	283.25	3.86%
a 3 - Billing	is & Contract Compliance					
Consul	tants:					
	Audit of Monthly Billings - Toll Collection Related Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Office Audits Engineering - D Contract Estimates - Field Audits Pre-Award Audits Engineering - D Contracts Contractor's Claims Processing Contract Payments (est. 600) Pre-Payment Audit Lease & Office Rental Billings (L Contracts) Misc Service Billings - C Contracts Drug Testing, Training, Safety, Benefits Legal & Finance Professional Billings - C Contracts Real Estate Appraisal billings - C Contracts Utilities & Municipal Agreements Railroads / Force Agreements	3 1A 3 1B 3 1C 3 1D 3 1E 3 1F 3 1G 3 1H 3 1J 3 1J 3 1K 3 1L	28 125 2 10 As needed 1 4 15 15 4 5 2 <b>211</b>	43 77 0 9 0 0 3 14 7 2 2 2 4 <b>161</b>	419 1163.25 0 82.25 0 20.25 66.5 18.5 11.25 8 25 <b>1814</b>	24.75%
Goverr	Immental Agencies: Department of Law Office of the State Comptroller Billing Department of Civil Service Administration NYS Retirement System Billing State Police Troop T Payroll (Quarterly) State Police Troop T Non-Personal Service costs Department of Labor Unemployment Insurance	3 2A 3 2B 3 2C 3 2D 3 2E 3 2F 3 2G	As needed As needed 2 1 4 1 1 <b>9</b>	0 0 1 4 1 2 <b>9</b>	0 0 10.5 12 97 60 50 <b>229.5</b>	3.13%

Audit Area	Category Description	Audit Category Number	Resource Allocation (Number of Audits)	2023 Actual Audits Performed	Resource Allocation (Hours)	
Conce	ssions:				, , ,	
	Concessionaire Agreements - Repair & Replacement, Cap Imp.	3 3A	2	0	0	
	Concessionaire Agreements - Gas Pricing Review	3 3B	2	0	0	
	Fuel Service Facilities - Remediations Ongoing	3 3C	12	12	104.5	
Other:	Assistance to Other Units - Review of RFPs, Draft Contracts and Evaluation Committees	3 4A	2	1	8	
			18	13	112.5	1.54%
Total -	- Area 3		238	183	2156	29.42%
Area 4 - Asset	Control					
Equips	nent: FIELD AUDITS					
Equipi	Motorized Equipment	4 1A	8	0	0	
	Office/Computer Equipment	4 1B	8	19	250.5	
	Shop Equipment	4 1D 4 1C	5	4	137	
	Communications Equipment Inventory	4 10 4 1D	1	0	0	
	Toll Equipment	4 1D 4 1E	As needed	0	0	
	Tool Complements & Controls	4 1E	5	29	230.25	
	Scrapping or Surplus Assets	4 1G	1	0	0	
	Scrapping of Scriptus Assets	410	28	52	617.75	8.43%
Invento						
	Fuel Inventory Reconciliation	4 2A	1	0	0	
	Reconcile Inventories - Division Stores (4 Divisions & Sign Shop)	4 2B	5	7	167	
	Section Stores Inventory Verification	4 2C	7	7	174.5	
	HQ Supplies Inventory Verification	4 2D	As needed	2	105	
			13	16	446.5	6.09%
Cash,	Checks, Credit cards and Accounts Receiveable:					
	Procurement Card Audits	4 3A	4	12	73.15	
	Account Receivable Confirmations	4 3B	1	0	0	
	Account Receiveable Reconciliation	4 3C	1	1	6.5	
	Cash Funds (petty cash)	4 3D	4	1	0	
	Check Signing reconcilliation	4 3E	12	7	100	
			22	21	179.65	2.45%
Total -	- Area 4		63	89	1243.9	16.97%
Area 5 - Salary	/ & Benefits - Employees & Retirees					
Employ	yee Compensation (Payroll & Negotiated Benefits)					
	Salary Raises/Step Advances	5 1A	2	5	1064.5	
	Retroactive Salary or Contractual Payments (Call-out Incentive)	5 1B	2	1	76.25	
	Vacation Buyback	5 1C	1	0	0	
	Health Insurance Opt-out	5 1D	1	1	27.5	
	Semi-Annual Incentive & Bonus for Non-use Sick Leave	5 1E	4	4	111	
	Payoff & Comparison of Payroll to Roster	5 1F	1	0	0	
	Commuter Use of TWY Provided Vehicles	5 1G	1	1	100	
			12	12	1379.25	18.82%

Audit Area	Category Description	Audit Category Number	Resource Allocation (Number of Audits)	2023 Actual Audits Performed	Resource Allocation (Hours)	
Health	Insurance & Other Fringe Benefits:					
	Pre-Implementation Audit of Health Insurance Rates	5 2A	1	1	37.5	
	Reconciliation of TWY Health Insurance Enrollees	5 2B	1	0	0	
	Unemployment Billings Review	5 2C	As needed	0	0	
	Survivor's Benefit	5 2D	4	4	11.25	
			6	5	48.75	0.67%
Time &	Attendance: Field Audits Head Counts Nightime Audits of Winter Maint. Verification of Seasonal Employees Verification of Timekeeper Records	5 3A 5 3B 5 3C 5 3D	0 0 8 <b>8</b>	0 0 8 8	0 0 58.75 <b>58.75</b>	0.80%
Total -	Area 5		26	25	1486.75	20.29%
TOTAL	_ ALL CATEGORIES		549	363	7328.9	100.00%